COMPLEMENTARY APPROACHES TO THE STUDY OF RELIGION: AN APPLICATION TO A STUDY OF GOSPEL MUSIC IN ZIMBABWE

Ezra Chitando
University Of Zimbabwe

Abstract
Western scholars of religion have been engaged in serious methodological debates. Social scientists and religionist scholars have been locked in mortal combat. This article questions the deep chasm that has been created by applying the historical, sociological and religionist approaches to a study of gospel music in Zimbabwe. It illustrates how each approach helps to clarify the meaning of this phenomenon. The article is a call to remove methodological debates from scholarly abstraction into practical application. It concludes by reflecting on the position of the African scholar of religion in the application of methods in the academic study of religion.

Introduction
The academic study of religion has been characterised by fiery methodological debates. Boundary disputes and interdisciplinary warfare characterise these scholarly exchanges. Although many camps may be detected, it is the confrontation between 'religionist' and 'social scientific' scholars that has engendered some memorable exchanges. At stake has been the search for an approach that will do justice to the religions of the world. This paper contributes to the debate by interrogating the Western scholars' preoccupation with methodological canons. In this context, a study of factors that contributed to the popularity of gospel music in Zimbabwe is undertaken. Cognisant of the fact that no religious phenomenon takes place outside the social context (Smart 1996: 11), this article highlights the impact of numerous social changes on the evolution of gospel music in the country. However, the need for caution when employing social-scientific strategies in an effort to understand religious phenomena is noted. Consequently, a religionist paradigm is also adopted in an endeavour to appreciate gospel music in Zimbabwe on its own terms. It is hoped that by tying methodological reflections to concrete empirical research, scholarship may thus be rescued from becoming recondite.

1. Methodological remarks
Western scholars of religion have expended a lot of energy in searching for an appropriate method that may be employed in the academic study of religion. Due to the fact that the discipline known as religious studies developed out of European faculties of theology, most worlds have centred on the extent to which a truly scientific approach to the study of religion may be developed. Those scholars espousing social scientific strategies (cf Wiebe 1990, Segal 1989 and Strenski 1993) maintain that religion is best understood when it is regarded as natural phenomenon. These scholars are averse to any theological interpretation of religion. In addition, they are also wary of religionist approaches to the study of religion. These insist that religion is irreducible, unique and a discipline in its own right. Daniel L Pals summarises this stance when he writes, 'The student of religion can insist that within the observable world there is a set of phenomena, definable as 'religious', which are in some sense sui generis, they are
distinctively things of their own sort’, not of another’ (Pals 1990: 2-3).

It is on the basis of the idea that religion constitutes an autonomous area of investigation that the [phenomenology/history of religions] approach opposes explanations of religion that go outside the phenomenon. By insisting that religious phenomena ought to be understood on their own terms, religionist scholars uphold Mircea Eliade’s contention. He wrote:

A religious phenomenon will only be recognised as such if it is grasped at its own level, that is to say, if it is studied as something religious. To try and grasp the essence of such a phenomenon by means of physiology, psychology, sociology, economics, linguistics, art or any other study is false; it misses the one unique and irreducible element in it - the element of the sacred’ (Eliade 1963: xiii).

Within the phenomenology/history of religions school, a firm anti-reductionism spirit reigns. While the practitioners of the method would describe themselves of belonging to the science of religion, critics detect ‘crypto-theological agendas in their work (Wiebe 1988: 14).

This sharp separation of religionist and social scientific approaches has resulted in the unfortunate impression that religious studies is a discipline that is unsure of itself. Walter H Capps’ observation decades ago is still applicable. He noted: ‘Because there is no clear, conscious second-order tradition in the science of religion there is profound uncertainty regarding the configuration, boundaries and self-definition of the field’ (Capps 1979: 180).

The absence of scholarly consensus on the character of the discipline is a result of divergent methodological lenses through which the phenomenon of religion has been viewed. Is it possible to achieve rapprochement? Are the methods intrinsically antagonistic, preventing a polymethodic approach (Smart 1985:78)? This presentation offers a positive response to the first question and engages with the second question by way of applying three approaches to the study of a particular religious phenomenon.

Although methodological debates have helped to clarify issues and sharpen perspectives (Whalming 1995:21), the neutral observer may be inclined to believe that careers are being enhanced at the expense of the investigation of religious phenomena. This study responds to the question posed above by employing insights from different approaches in an effort to understand a specific phenomenon. The occurrence and increasing popularity of gospel music in Zimbabwe is approached from three main perspectives. Firstly, the contribution of the history of religions is harnessed in order to put gospel music into proper historical perspective. As a discipline the history of religions (Kitagawa 1985) places emphasis on the historical development of religious phenomena. It identifies internal dynamics and external influences relating to the religious aspects under investigation. The overarching concern is to provide a context in which religions can be integrated (Schmidt 1988: 30). In this study a short history of musical performance in Zimbabwe is provided. This enables us to understand and appreciate the explosion of gospel music in contemporary black Zimbabwean society.

Apart from adopting a historical perspective, the study also employs a sociological approach. It examines the ascendancy of gospel music in Zimbabwe by paying special attention to the socio-economic context. Rather than maintaining a rigid functionalist stance by focusing on what a religious phenomenon does in society, this investigation also highlights how the prevailing context has facilitated the popularity of gospel music. Sociological studies entail an analysis of the details of religion in a given context and how they vary as the context changes (Bourdillon 1990:2). By drawing attention to the high death rate and difficult economic times in contemporary Zimbabwe, this study provides an explanatory framework as to why music with religious overtones is flourishing. The insights of sociologists of religion when they examine ‘how religion operates at the social level to solve a number of related
problems' (Comstock 1971:13) are employed in this regard.

In an endeavour to demonstrate the complementary nature of these approaches, the study also draws on the formulations of scholars within the religionist paradigm. Respecting the believer's point of view and upholding the conscious meaning of religion for the practitioners represents a key religionist dogma (Chitando 1997:6). Adopting this stance allows us to understand the role of gospel music within Zimbabwean Christianity. While historical and sociological approaches provide valuable information pertaining to the status of gospel music, restricting the study to these approaches precludes the possibility of investigating the 'veritable insides'. Exploring the religious significance of gospel music demands the application of religionist strategies. However, this should not be misconstrued to imply that only a religionist approach avails the real meaning of religious phenomenon. One fully agrees with James L Cox when he notes that the method becomes fully interdisciplinary when religious meanings are employed alongside explanations emanating from other disciplines such as sociology or psychology (Cox 1996: 58). It becomes necessary to illustrate how this polymethodic approach can be realised by utilising the three selected approaches in the study of gospel music in Zimbabwe.

2. A historical approach to commercial music performance in Zimbabwe

The marked rise in the commercial production of music with Christian themes cannot be understood outside the history of African music performance in Zimbabwe. It is necessary to indicate the importance of music in the traditional society, the impact of colonialism on musical performance and show how the post-colonial climate has impacted on the generation of musical products. An understanding of these factors will foster an appreciation of the status of gospel music in contemporary Zimbabwe.

2.1 Music in a traditional setting

While it is correct to assert that any reference to a traditional, precolonial African past is replete with difficulties (Chitando 1998b:24), it is permissible to highlight the role played by music among the Shona people in Zimbabwe. Like other African communities, the Shona people had music deeply embedded in their lives. Songs were built into the numerous games for children, in lullabies and in battles. Fred Zindi accurately detects the manifold role of music in the Zimbabwean traditional culture. He writes:

Different songs are sung for different occasions. There are songs for tragedies such as death, floods or drought; there are songs for social and ceremonial occasions such as weddings, the enthroning of a chief, parties and during harvest time when a village community gathers to sing praises to Mwari (God) to thank him for the wonderful harvest - or during hunting (Zindi 1985:2)

Although talented composers could be found, the music of traditional society was communally owned. No one could claim the product as exclusively their own and the music reflected cultural concerns. Berliner (1978: 20-25) convincingly shows that in traditional Zimbabwean society music was part and parcel of community living, a reflection of people's personal lives and social organisation. It was employed in work, religion, celebration, political life and history.

The role of music in the Shona traditional religion cannot be overemphasized. As a religion thriving on spirit possession (Bucher 1980), traditional religion has made extensive use of music since it is a prime way of inducing spirit possession. In the traditional setting religious
music was an intricate part of ritual performance. Song such as *Tora Uta Hwako* ('Take your bows') and *Havo ndibaba* ('Behold, it is father') featured prominently and signalled the arrival of the ancestral spirits from *nyikadzimu* (Land of the ancestors). Hand-clapping, vigorous dancing and the traditional format of call-and-response, common among Southern peoples (Nompula 1996: 132) ensured communal participation. The *mbira* musical instrument was invaluable, its melodious rhythms enticing the spirits to join the living (Maraire 1990). Music was also central in the *shavi* (alien spirit) rituals, as well as at other rites of passages.

It can be seen that music was intricately intertwined with virtually all aspects of life in traditional Shona society. Although external influences could be detected due to interaction with other communities, particularly through trade, the role of music was not radically transformed. It continued to be contextually relevant, having wide application within Shona culture. This was bound to change from 1890 onwards when colonialism became a dominant factor social change. As the onslaught of modernity, Christianity and commercialisation took its toll on the African people, the arena of music performance could not remain unchanged.

### 2.2 The influence of colonialism on traditional music

The story of colonialism, its impact on African identity and institutions has been recounted on numerous occasions. Space considerations preclude the possibility of narrating it herein, although the general historiography is well known. It is also apparent that the African encounter with Western modernity has not been a benign one (Balcomb 1996, Kaulemu 1997), although to their credit Africans have 'at a deeper level negotiated and survived the scourge - by relativising it, resisting it, and modifying it with uncanny creativity (Maluleke 1996:8). African music performance under colonialism witnessed a lot of changes, with a number of developments influencing the current rise in the popularity of commercially produced Christian music.

While it is not possible to provide an exhaustive list of all the factors that shaped African music performance under colonialism, it is necessary to draw attention to the work of a Zimbabwean scholar. Caleb Dube (1996: 106 - 111) highlights how colonial institutions such as the Christian church, the British army, municipalities and private companies had a bearing on the commercialisation of music and the emergence of cultural workers in Zimbabwe. The process of urbanisation, particularly the emergence of black townships as well as the practice of migrant labour also affected African music performance. However, since gospel music is closely related to developments within the Christian church, more attention shall be paid to this source of influence.

The development of hymns in Zimbabwean Christianity has received little scholarly attention (cf Axelsson 1974). Christian missionaries felt compelled to interact with African culture, although most imposed Christian and European music on the local converts. Through the mission school, Africans also learned to play European musical instruments. It is also clear that before 1890, the arrival of the colonising Pioneer Column that marked the start of a lasting European and Christian presence, hymns were heard from hunters, traders and migrant labourers (Lenherr 1977: 103). From 1890 - 1950, direct and often contrived translations of English hymns into Shona characterised hymnody across the different missions. There was very little creativity in terms of tapping indigenous resources. A condescending attitude to Africa music prevailed.

After the Second World War Africans in many churches were allowed their own musical expression (Dube 1996: 106, Lenherr 1977: 111-114). The Dutch Reformed Church, and Evangelical Lutheran Church, the United Methodist Church and the Roman Catholic Church,
were at the forefront, although they differed in nuance and detail concerning the place of neo-African church music. From 1950 onwards one witnesses an increasing appreciation of local compositions. The year 1965 witnessed the composition of a dramatic and musical play, *Mazuva ekupedzisa* by Abraham Dumisani Maraire (Axelsson 1993: 17). New African music composers such as Mr Patrick Matsikenyiri, John Nduna and Julius Mashuku also composed poetic texts based on biblical references and music in the late 1970s (Axelsson 1993: 19). Although such recordings took place within the context of church music drama, their influence on the larger society was considerable (Maraire: 1998).

As the developments outlined above were occurring within the church, African music performance outside it was being affected by the British army, municipalities and private companies. In particular, municipalities promoted the liquor industry and the municipal beer gardens became the centre of cultural activity and an important source of innovation in music (Wolcott 1974:83). Private companies, such as Mangula Mine, scouted for musicians in Harare, who would entertain mine workers using Western instruments (Zindi 1985: 30-31). All these factors resulted in the commercialisation of music. One could now refer to a ‘music industry’ dominated by recording companies, performing artists and music promoters. With the radio service reaching many Africans through the colonial broadcasting service, the stage was set for the professionalisation of popular music in the neo/postcolonial dispensation in Zimbabwe.

However, before one can discuss the impact of the opening up of the opening up of Zimbabwean society, hitherto barred from freely interacting with the international community because of the Unilateral Declaration of Independence in 1965, there is need to draw attention to the profound role played by songs during armed liberation struggle (1972-1979). These songs, popularised at the nightly meetings for political consciousness and conveyed through radios Maputo in Mozambique and Dar es Salaam in Tanzania, were a vehicle for mobilisation, and a source of courage for many combatants. A useful and early study of such songs is found in Pongwени (1982). Significantly for this presentation, most of these songs were adaptations of well-known Christian hymns. However, Pongwени (1982: viii) fails to realise the impact of the hymns on the cadres when he writes that ‘they decided therefore, that in the war situation, since no other form of popular culture exerted a strong enough influence to reduce reliance on hymns, it was imperative to exploit this form, if only to mock it’. Perhaps the tendency to under-play the hymns may be understood historically since Pongwени was writing during the euphoria of political independence and the rhetoric of socialism was at its height. Our discussion of developments within church music above illustrates the extent to which hymnody affected the African way of life in a fundamental way.

2.3 **Music performance in postcolonial Zimbabwe**

Zimbabwe gained her political independence in 1980 and this opened the country to a new, heightened wave of international musical influences. Dube (1996: 112) shows the influence of foreign reggae bands and artists such as Bob Marley, who performed at the celebrations in 1980, Misty in Roots and UB 40. Local artists such as Thomas Mapfumo, Oliver Mutukudzi, Leonard Zhakata, Stella Chiweshe and many other have succeeded in producing internationally - recognised music. As the country liberalised the economy in the 1990s more and more foreign artists have entered the local music market, most notably Zairian *rhumba* and South African *mbaqanga*.

Of particular importance to this study is the fact that it is in the postcolonial era that commercially produced music with Christian themes, popularly called *gospel music*, has
thrived. As in other aspects of Zimbabwean Christianity, historically one cannot overlook the South African influence. The rise of African Independent/ Instituted Churches (AICs) in Zimbabwe may be traced to migrant labourers who brought the phenomenon from South Africa, while the Ruwadzano or women’s guild also has its origin in that country (Verstraelsen-Gilhuys 1982:188). Gospel artists and groups in South Africa such as the late Freedom Sengwayo, the Holy Spirits Choir and the Holy Cross Choir popularised gospel music in Zimbabwe through live performances and availability of their recorded music in the mid-1980s. In addition, African - American gospel music started making in-roads into the Zimbabwean market, inspiring many local artists to venture into this brand of music. Since popular music had been taken over by capitalism and commercialisation, gospel music had also fallen prey to these powerful forces that brook no rivals. From 1990 onwards, Zimbabwe has witnessed an explosion of gospel music. It is necessary to turn to a discussion of the major reason for the popularity of this music which carries the Christian message.

3. A sociological examination of the dominance of gospel music in Zimbabwe

The contention that gospel music is enjoying marked success in Zimbabwe is borne by the fact that the chart shows invariably have gospel songs in the top five. In public transport, particularly the commuter omnibuses, recorded Christian music dominates. Significantly, prominent artists who rose to fame while playing non-Christian music, such as Oliver Mutukudzi, Cephas Mashakada, David ‘Mr Bulk’ Chiyangwa and Zacks Manatsa, are all now recording gospel music. Indeed, there is proliferation of bands playing gospel music, with almost all young and promising musicians seeking to record Christian songs (Almero 1998). This calls for an identification of some of the factors which have resulted in the near-saturation of the musical market with gospel songs.

3.1 The predominance of Christianity

Any sociological analysis of Zimbabwean society will establish that Christian values and norms have become deeply entrenched. Although statistical accuracy is difficult to attain due to the hybridisation characterising Zimbabwean Christianity (Chitando 1998a: 225), it is clear that the influence of Christianity on black Zimbabweans is massive. Alongside local culture, Christianity has provided ‘another world to live by’ for many people. Since the education system during colonialism was under mission influence, many Zimbabweans who are now adults went through the mission school. Although some may no longer be active Christians, they continue to identify with a Christian ethos.

The presence of a predominantly Christian market ensures the popularity of songs with Christian themes. In addition, the wave of African pentecostalism has had an impact on local Christianity. As David Maxwell (1998: 225) notes, what is new about this phenomenon is ‘its recent growth, enormous vitality and its appropriation of the electronic media’, particularly the ‘Praise and Worship’ sessions. These have become the loci of gospel music performance. This movement, has influenced the rise of charismatic renewal in ‘mail-line’ churches such as the Catholic, Anglican and Methodist churches. In Zimbabwe, the influence can also be detected in the rise of music with an increased tempo among these historic mission churches. This in turn has expanded the sector of society amenable to the overtures of gospel music.

Although the role of the ‘electronic church’ in Zimbabwe is not pronounced (Armst and Lundby 1993), the facilitating affect of the television programme ‘The Psalmody’ should not be overlooked. Alongside radio programmes such as ‘Beat with a Message’ and Nzyo
dzechitendero (‘Religious songs’), it has brought gospel music into many people’s homes. The idea of setting aside time, even if it is only half an hour, for gospel music engenders a popular feeling that it belongs to its own genre. The popularity of this type of music is further made evident by the decision to hold annual gospel extravaganza shows, no doubt as a parallel to the Zimbabwean Musicians Day which brings together artists playing different types of music. It can therefore be safely argued that the predominance of Christianity in Zimbabwe is a major reason for the acceptance of gospel music.

3.2 The high death rate

A textual and form - critical analysis of the gospel songs produced and consumed in Zimbabwe shows a preoccupation with death. Most of the recorded songs are popular hymns and choruses that are sung at funerals. When one examines tracks such as Masodzi (‘Tears’) by Youth in Action, Tiumai Mweya (‘Send your Spirit’) by ‘Mr Bulk’ and many other songs, one realises that these are funeral songs. They are meant to plead on behalf of the dead and to console the bereaved. Like funeral songs in traditional culture, the mood created is sombre and the beat is disciplined. Funerals have become part and parcel of the Zimbabwean way of life. The high incidence of HIV/AIDS, representing the highest level of infection in the world, has meant that more than seven hundred people die every week. Songs that capture this tragic reality are bound to strike a chord.

In order for relatives and friends travelling to a funeral to ‘get themselves into the mood’ audio gospel music cassettes are played on the way. Since most Africans continue to prefer to be buried near the ancestral home, funeral trips often entail long journeys and it is impractical for people to be singing all the way. In addition, many people use the recorded music to remember their beloved, as the songs may have featured extensively at the wake, funeral or nyaradzo (memorial).

3.3 Trying economic times and opportunism by some artists

As the discussion on the history of African music performance in Zimbabwe shows, commercialisation has become a salient aspect. Some recording companies and artists have detected that gospel music is selling and they have seized the opportunity (Zindi 1998). It is also significant to note that the period marking the ascendancy of gospel music in Zimbabwe, 1990 to the present, coincides with the increase in poverty (Kaliati 1998: 11). Offering solace in trying socio-economic conditions, gospel music has found a ready market.

4 A religionist interpretation of the role of gospel music

Although the historical and sociological approaches provide useful information in clarifying the status of gospel music in Zimbabwe, there is need for a religionist understanding. What is the religious importance of the phenomenon? Given the fact that it is a development occurring within the church and outside it, what is its significance? Space considerations prevent an elaborate discussion of the themes outlined below. Roberta King (1990) notes that music has a central role to play in Christian life and some of the areas of influence have been adapted in the following paragraphs.

4.1 Gospel music as a form of evangelism

The numerous gospel artists in Zimbabwe, particularly those rooted within the church, maintain that their music is a form of Christian witness. The music is a call for people to turn
to God and lead morally upright lives. Gospel music, they contend, is a legitimate frontier in evangelistic efforts. Indeed, prominent gospel singers like Mechanic Manyeruke, the late Brian Sibalo, Rita Musekiwa and many others have recruited a significant number of people to Christianity through their singing. It is also important to note that many local artists specialising in popular music started singing in church. This pattern is replicated in South Africa and is true of many international pop stars (Zindi 1998). Gospel music however, it regarded as different in that its ethos is understood as inspired and missionary.

4.2 Gospel music as a worship facilitator and source of ecumenism

Numerous biblical texts, particularly Psalms 150: 3-5, Rev 14:2 and others call upon believers to praise God through music. As noted earlier, the ‘Praise and Worship’ sessions of Pentecostal Christianity in Zimbabwe have influenced a large percentage of recorded gospel music. In addition, groups within the different denominations in Zimbabwe have also recorded hymns and original compositions. Some independent gospel artists have recorded popular choruses from AICs (Mujuru 1998). Also, the availability of musical products from South African gospel singers like Sipho Makubane, Derrick Ndizamnde, Rebecca Malope, and others has increased ecumenism. Gospel music is bought across the denominational and even religious barriers, promoting spontaneous forms of ecumenism (Chitando 1998a: 227).

4.3 Gospel music and narrative theology

As the church in Africa ‘explores alternative ways of doing theology’ (Balcomb 1998) in the postcolonial situation, gospel music may be regarded as a developer of narrative theology. As the artists compose songs highlighting the suffering and death of the people of Zimbabwe, they are engaged in a narrative theology liberation. This calls upon believers to detect the hand of God, even when living in the House of Hunger. By drawing motifs from hymns and traditional songs, particularly the call-and-response formula, gospel music may be seen as an initiator of contextualisation. This form of a narrative theology of inculteration promises new vistas for theology in Africa. The following has been noted:

The starting point is African culture, but specifically African oral literature and the wide range of narrative and oral forms: proverbs, riddles, stories, myths, plays and songs explained in their historical and cultural contexts (Healey and Sybertz 1996: 28).

Given the centrality of singing hymns, both traditional and Christian in Africa (Hastings 1990) and the worsening socio-economic conditions in Zimbabwe, gospel music has become an avenue of escape, a source of hope and an important vehicle for locating identity (Bessant 1994).

5. Interdisciplinary approaches and the African scholar of religion

In this study an interdisciplinary approach was adopted in order to investigate the popularity of gospel music in Zimbabwe. A historical background to African music performance was provided, alongside a sociological analysis of the prevailing context. These approaches facilitated an understanding of what Harold Turner (1981: 1-15) called ‘the milieu’ within which religion is interwoven. Having brought out the ‘given’ context, a religionist interpretation of gospel music as a distinct religious phenomenon (though influenced by its environment) was preferred. It is hoped that this application of a polymethodic approach avails a complete and rounded picture of gospel music in contemporary Zimbabwe.
From the preceding discussion it becomes clear that territory-claiming and methodological warfare, so characteristic of the Western discourse on religion, is not always helpful. While it may be understood within the context of the drying up of the raw date pertaining to religion, the African scholar should not be confessionally bound to any particular approach. The theories and methods should be subservient to the larger concern of investigating and clarifying religious phenomena. As this study has attempted to illustrate, approaches to the study of religion are complementary in character. Those selected in this study are like the status of different traditional knives; their use depends on the section of the carcass from which one wants to cut.

6. Conclusion

Western religious studies has bequeathed a heritage of methodological confrontation for African scholars. Since the religions of Africa in their plurality await continued investigation, J Platvoet's (1996: 129) call for African scholars to be engaged in methodological debates ought to be approached cautiously. Perhaps a way forward in African religious studies consists of tying methodological issues to practical research. It is hoped that our investigation of gospel music in Zimbabwe from historical, sociological and religionist perspectives illustrates the possibility of a holistic appreciation of religious phenomena.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


